

Rhodes, Greece, 31 August to 2 September 2017

Accumulation and Translocation of heavy metals from soils to vegetables by sewage effluent application in territory of Rawalpindi

Khan K. A.^{1*}, Azhar Naeem A.² and Awan Z. A.¹

¹Institute of Agricultural Sciences, University of the Punjab, Lahore.

² Pir Mehar Ali Shah Arid agriculture University, Rawalpindi

*corresponding author: Kashif Ali Khan

e-mail: rana13tda@yahoo.com

Abstract

Application of sewage effluent for growing vegetables in peri-urben areas of big cities has become a common practice. A survey was conducted during 2008-2009 from 15 different sites of Rawalpindi, Pakistan to assess accumulation of heavy metals in soil and edible parts of vegetables by application of sewage effluents. Samples were collected randomly from sewage effluents, nearby soil and vegetables, and were analyzed for Zn, Ni, Mn, Pb, Fe, Cu, Co, Cr and Cd contents. Results revealed exceeding concentration of Ni (43%), Mn (71%), Pb (29%), Cu (29%) and Cr (43%) in sewage effluent. Fields (surface and in sub-surface soil) receiving sewage effluent were higher in metals contents than safe limits except Cd, Ni, Co and Pb. Vegetables (coriander, spinach, garlic, tomato and chili) grown in these field were found 100% contaminated and accumulation of heavy metals was higher than the WHO/FAO recommended permissible limits.

Keywords: Heavy metals, sewage effluent, contaminated soil, vegetables, peri-urban area

1. Introduction

Water is necessary for the survival and existence of all living organism on this planet. About 6% water is used for domestic, 3% for industrial and 90% of the total available water is used for irrigation purposes (Khan et at., 2013). Wastewater generated by domestic, industrial and commercial sources has increased with urbanization (Akram et al., 2006; Qadir et al., 2008). In urban areas of many countries wastewater is used as a source of irrigation water to some extent (Huibers et al., 2004). In Pakistan the shortage of surface water supply is being compensated by the conjunctive use of ground water and urban wastewater (sewage and industrial effluents) for irrigation to grow cereals and vegetables (Hussain et al., 2002). Farmers use sewage-contaminated municipal water for irrigation of crops earned more than those using freshwater (Ensink et al., 2004). However, wastewater contains large amount of organic material and inorganic elements essential for proper growth and development of crops (Mitra and Gupta,

1999). Rawalpindi is one of the over populated and polluted city which may cause soil pollution and contaminate the vegetables grown with it (Ullah et al., 2011). The heavy metals such as Cd, Co, Cr, Cu, Fe, Mn, Ni, Pb, and Zn have been identified from different industrial effluents (Asaolu, 1995). Some of the heavy metals are vital for proper plant growth but the others are not essential so after accumulating in the soil they could be shifted to food chain and caused detrimental effects (Ghafoor et al., 1995; Malla et al., 2007). Even low concentrations of heavy metals have damaging effects to man and animals because there is no established mechanism for their elimination from the body (Khan et al., 2013). Nowadays toxic heavy metals in wastewater are abundant because of their undue use in industrial applications (Singh et al., 2004; Chen et al., 2005). Longterm application of treated and untreated waste water resulted in significant buildup of heavy metals in soil, vegetables, cereals and their subsequent transfer to food chain causing potential health risk to consumers (Khan et al., 2008; Singh et al., 2010; Gupta et al., 2011; Ullah et al., 2011; Gosh et al., 2012). Heavy metal concentrations in plants were significantly higher grown in wastewaterirrigated soils than in the reference soil (Khan et al., 2008; Singh et al., 2010; Gupta et al., 2011; Meyer et al., 2016). Metal accumulation in soils, forage grass, milk from cattle, leafy and non-leafy vegetables was found more than the permissible limits (Sahu et al., 2007; Chary et al., 2008). Thus, the accumulation of such toxic compounds, especially of heavy metals having highly hazardous effect on living organisms, can cause undesirable changes in the biosphere with hazardous consequences (Ashwini et al., 2014). The present study was undertaken to assess the heavy metal content/status of the sewage-water-irrigated soil and vegetables and to correlate the heavy metal concentration of sewage water to that of the soil and plants.

2. Methodology

2.1. Sample Collection and preparation

The survey was conducted in 2009 in peri-urban area of Rawalpindi, Pakistan. Fifteen sites were selected and 3 samples in replicate from each site were collected for each soil, water and contaminated plants. Sewage effluent was collected in plastic bottles and added concentrated nitric acid to minimize microbial activity. Soil samples from two depths (0-15 cm and 15-30 cm) were taken from farmer field by using spiral auger where sewage-effluent was being used. Randomly collected samples were bulked together to make composite sample, passed through 2 mm mesh sieve and stored in plastic jars. Similarly Vegetables samples were collected from the same field, washed with distilled water then sun dried.

2.2. Soil, plant and water analysis

AB-DTPA method (Soltanpour and Workman, 1985) was used for the determination of heavy metals. Ten grams of well-prepared soil was weighed into 125 mL conical flask. Twenty milliliter of extracting solution was made by mixing ammonium bicarbonate and 0.005 DTPA. This solution was shaken on a reciprocal shaker for 15 minutes at 180 cycle's min⁻¹. Supernatant was obtained by filtering above solution through Whatman no.42 filter paper. Plant samples were dried in hot air oven at 65 °C for 24 hours, ground and stored in plastic jars. To estimate heavy metals, 1 g of plant material was transferred into 100 mL pyrex digestion tube, 10 ml of 1:2 HClO4 + HNO3 acidic mixture was added and allowed to stand overnight. After initial digestion, mixture was heated in block digester up to 235 °C and process was continued until the white fumes of perchloric acid start appearing. After cooling down the mixture, its volume was made to 100 mL with distilled water (Issac and Johnson, 1975). Prepared filtrates of plants and soil samples were used for determination of heavy metals (Zn, Cu, Mn, Cr, Cd, Ni, Pb, Fe & Co) by using Atomic Absorption Spectrophotometer and hallow cathode lamps were also changed for each metal. The metals present in sewage effluent were also analyzed by method of AOAC (1984).

2.3. Statistical Analysis

The data collected was subjected to statistical analysis for better interpretation by calculating means and standard deviation (Steel *et al.* 1997).

3. Results and Discussion

3.1. Heavy Metals Concentration in Sewage and Industrial Effluents

Descriptive statistics regarding the results of heavy metals concentration in effluents is given in the Table 1, which revealed that the concentration of iron, zinc, manganese and copper vary considerably. Iron concentration in sewage effluents varied from 0.42 to 3.04 mg L⁻¹, Zinc $(0.003 \text{ to } 0.084 \text{ mg } \text{L}^{-1})$ Manngnese $(0.041 \text{ to } 1.03 \text{ mg } \text{L}^{-1})$ and copper ranged from 0.04 to 0.84 mg L⁻¹. Zinc and iron were found 100% within the permissible limits, Cu 29% and Mn was recorded 71% above the critical levels presented by WWF (2007) Pakistan for irrigational water quality. The highest nickel concentration in sewage and industrial effluents was recorded 0.43 mg L⁻¹ at Ali Abad. According to WWF (2007) Pakistan, for irrigational water quality the critical limit of nickel is 0.2 mg L⁻¹ and 58% samples were observed safe limit and 42% found unsafe for irrigational purpose in Rawalpindi territory. The

highest lead concentration was obtained (0.131 mg L^{-1}) at Dhhok Hasso in sewage water. According to limits given by WWF (2007) Pakistan for lead (0.1 mg L⁻¹) so analysed 71% water samples were observed safe and 29% found unsafe for irrigational purpose. The highest chromium concentration was obtained (2.21 mg L⁻¹) at Dhhok Hasso in sewage water and at the few of sites Cr was not found in sewage effluent. According to critical limit for Cr (0.01 mg L⁻¹) set by WWF (2007) 57% sewage and industriasl effluents samples were found fit and 43% were found unfit for irrigational purpose and cobalt was recorded 100% within the permissible limit. At different sites heavy metal ions were found beyond the permissible limits it's because the sources of effluents were from textile industry, ghee and oil industry and domestic sewage also contributes to load heavy metals in sewage water (Ansari et al., 1993). Jagtap et al. (2010) found higher contents of Zn, Cu, Pb, Ni, Cd and Cr in effluents samples from Rawalpindi Area. Gosh et al. (2012) reported sewage water contained Cd, Cr and Ni in amounts above the permissible limits for its use to irrigation water.

3.2 Heavy metals in soil

Heavy metals contents in surface and sub-surface soil samples has been presented in Table 2. The results showed that Cd, Co, Cr, Cu, Fe, Mn, Ni, Pb, and Zn content in surface soil ranged from 0-0.65, 0-0.21, 1.1-7.4, 4.2-14.7, 12.4-27.4, 2.11-15.41, 1.19-6.02, 2.39-21.32, and 2.3-25 mg kg⁻¹ respectively with mean value 0.11 ± 0.17 , 0.03±0.05, 3.61±1.99, 9.41±3.57, 18.55±4.78, 7.96±4.15, 3.76 ± 1.45 , 8.48 ± 6.42 and 6.57 ± 5.94 mg kg⁻¹, similarly as in surface soil metals contents higher the metal contents in subsurface soil were founds in accordance to surface soil (table 2). According to the McLean et al. (1987) the permissible metal contents in soil the Cr, Cu, Fe, Mn and Zn were found 100% above the permissible limits. Same trend was observed in subsurface soil and where the metals contents were high in effluent the metals were founded higher in respective field. This might be due to the higher contents discharged from factories and long-run application of sewage effluent water for crop production. Similar results were reported by Khan et al. (1992) and Zhang et al. (2006) reported in occurdance to investigated results when sewage sludge was applied for crop irrigation. Untreated domestic waste and discharge from industries cause toxicity of heavy metals in soils reported by Ansari (1993). Ghafoor (2004) reported that the urban soils of Faisalabad irrigated with city effluents for growing vegetables for more than 30 years have attained concentration of Fe above the safe limit.

3.3 Plant Analysis

Vegetables are consumed as leaf like spinach, coriander, and chili where as tomato and garlic used as fruit and root. Therefor its necessary to investigate the level of heavy metals up taken by the vegetables by the application of sewage effluent is toxic to human shown in table 3 and 4. Therefore the concentration of heavy metals was investigated in both leaf and fruit of vegetables. The metal accumulation in vegitabel parts (Table 3 and 4) depicted that Cd, Co, Cr, Cu, Fe, Mn, Ni, Pb, and Zn were up taken

Heavy metals (mg L ⁻¹)	Range	Mean±SD	Permissible limits (mg L ⁻¹)	Within Permissible limits (%)	Above the Permissible limits (%)
Cd	0-0.01	0±0	0.01	100	0
Со	00	0±0	0.05	100	0
Cr	0-2.21	0.33±0.82	0.01	57	43
Cu	0.04-0.82	0.23±0.27	0.2	71	29
Fe	0.42-3.04	1.66±1.03	5	100	0
Mn	0.04-1.03	0.34±0.32	0.2	29	71
Ni	0-0.43	0.13±0.16	0.2	57	43
Pb	0-0.13	0.05 ± 0.05	0.1	71	29
Zn	0-0.08	0.04 ± 0.03	2	100	0

Table 1. Heavy metals in sewage and industrial effluents and classification on the basis of permissible limits given by WWF for irrigational purpose.

Irrigational Water Quality by Waste Water Forum Pakistan 2007.

Table 2. Heavy metals in surface and sub-surface soil irrigated by industrial effluents and classification on the basis of permissible limits.

Heavy metals (mg kg ⁻ ¹)	Range	Mean±SD	Above the Permissible limits (%)	Range	Mean±SD	Above the Permissible limits (%)	Permissible limits (mg kg-1)
		0-15 cm			15-30 cm		
Cd	0-0.65	0.11±0.17	14	0-0.52	0.08±0.14	6	0.31*
Co	0-0.21	0.03 ± 0.05	14	0-0.13	0.02 ± 0.03	0	0.20*
Cr	1.1-7.4	3.61±1.99	100	0.7-3.33	2.07±0.99	80	1.00*
Cu	4.2-14.7	9.41±3.57	100	3.1-9.2	6.04±2.44	100	0.50**
Fe	12.4-27.4	18.55±4.78	100	9.52-20.21	14.7±3.72	100	5.00**
Mn	2.11- 15.41	7.96±4.15	100	1.1-9.21	4.66±2.46	100	1.00*
Ni	1.19-6.02	3.76±1.45	0	0.82-4	2.49±0.97	0	8.10*
Pb	2.39- 21.32	8.48±6.42	27	1.04-17.85	5.7±5.65	20	13.00*
Zn	2.3-25	6.57±5.94	100	1.8-20	5.6±4.71	100	1.50**

* Mclean et al. (1987), Availability of Zinc, Copper Nickel to plants grown in sewage treated soils.

** Sultanpur (1985). Use of AB-DTPA soil test to evaluate elemental availability and toxicity

at palnt affinity to metals that above the permissible levels. As in chili, coriander and garlic Co, Mn, Pb and Zn and exceptionally Cd in coriander were found 100% above the permissible limits provided by WHO (1996) and Asaolu (1995). Tomato and spinach were investigated highly accumulator for heavy metals, all investigated metals (Cd, Co, Cr, Cu, Fe, Mn, Ni, Pb, and Zn) were found 100% above the permissible levels given by WHO (1996) and Asaolu (1995). Metal accumulation by vegetables is affected by plant species and physicochemical activities, soil nature, temperature and rain fall also affect its uptake (Khan *et al.*, 2013). Farid *et al.* (2003) collected spinach, bitter gourd, okra, and eggplant samples and found that they were contaminated with heavy metals similarly in accordance to current results. Ronaq *et al.* (2005) collected spinach samples from and found unsafe for eating due to higher accumulation of heavy metal concentration. Liu *et al.* (2006) and Barman *et al.* (2000) also reported higher concentration of heavy metals in waste water grown vegetables. Heavy metal accumulation in vegetable grown in wastewater-irrigated soils was significantly detected higher than cultivated in the reference soil (Meyer *et al.*, 2016)

Chili				Garlic			
Heavy metals (mg kg ⁻¹)	Range	Mean±SD	Above the Permissible limits (%)	Range	Mean±SD	Above the Permissible limits (%)	Permissible limits (mg kg ⁻¹)
Cd	0-1.51	0.76±1.07	50	0.1-0.7	0.4±0.42	100	0.02*
Co	1.01-2.08	1.55±0.76	100	0	0±0	0	0.02*
Cr	0.75-1.27	1.01±0.37	0	0.89-1.17	1.03±0.2	0	1.30*
Cu	5.21-8.8	7.01±2.54	0	14.3-22.4	18.35±5.73	100	10.00*
Fe	95-120	107.5±17.67	0	55-114	84.5±41.71	0	150.0*
Mn	2.37-7.91	5.14±3.92	50	35.6-41.4	38.5±4.1	100	6.61*
Ni	2.92-3.4	3.16±0.34	0	8.4-12.3	10.35±2.76	67	10.00*
Pb	4.21-5.6	4.91±0.98	100	0-0.13	0.07 ± 0.09	0	2.00**
Zn	5.62-13.4	9.51±5.5	100	42-57	49.5±10.6	100	5.00*
	To	omato			Spina	ach	
Cd	1.08-7.77	4.12±3.38	100	0.04-2.08	0.63±0.89	100	0.02*
Co	0.82-4.26	2.39±1.73	100	0-0.81	0.17±0.36	20	0.02*
Cr	4.5-10.35	7.45±2.92	100	0.86-3.41	1.85 ± 1.02	60	1.30*
Cu	31-97	64.33±33	100	15.4-26.96	20.08±4.73	100	10.00*
Fe	177.32-215	194.89±18.9	100	160-297.4	226.78±58.99	100	150.0*
Mn	24.35-40	31.45±7.92	100	12.02-26.2	19.46±5.57	100	6.61*
Ni	12.25-20	15.83±3.9	100	2.52-4.55	3.49±0.8	0	10.00*
Pb	11.11-32.44	19.95±11.1	100	2.12-8.75	4.95±2.42	100	2.00**
Zn	19.4-32	25.73±6.3	100	13.21-24.5	18.18±4.39	100	5.00*

Table 3: Heavy metal accumulation in vegetables (mg kg⁻¹)

* WHO (1996) Critical levels of different metal ions in edible portion of vegetables

** Asaolu (1995) Critical levels of different metal ions in edible portion of vegetables

The mean value against each metal is avrage value of 45 sample from 15 differnt sites

Table 4: Heavy metal (mg kg⁻¹) accumulation in vegetables (Coriander)

Coriander				
Heavy metals (mg kg ⁻¹)	Range	Mean±SD	Above the Permissible limits (%)	Permissible limits (mg kg ⁻¹)
Cd	0.85-1.02	0.93±0.08	100	0.02*
Co	0	0±0	0	0.02*
Cr	0.45-1.02	0.78 ± 0.29	0	1.30*
Cu	12.8-24.4	18.59±5.8	67	10.00*
Fe	85-120	102.04±17.51	0	150.0*
Mn	8.5-10.5	9.65±1.03	100	6.61*
Ni	1.58-4.6	2.82±1.57	0	10.00*
Pb	1.88-4.3	2.84±1.28	67	2.00**
Zn	19.2-55	34±18.6	100	5.00*

* WHO (1996) Critical levels of different metal ions in edible portion of vegetables

** Asaolu (1995) Critical levels of different metal ions in edible portion of vegetables

The mean value against each metal is avrage value of 45 sample from 15 differnt sites

4. Conclusion

This surveyed was conducted with aim to estimate the heavy metals content in soil and vegetable grown under sewage effluent in peri-urban area of Rawalpindi. The results revealed that in sewage effluent the contents of Zn, Cu, Mn,Cr, Cd, Ni, Pb, Fe and Co were higher than permissible limits. The accumulations of heavy metals in soil were higher than the permissible limits but in vegetables tomato and spinach were higher in metal accumulation than rest of investigated vegetables. Study revealed that specific plants species have its affinity to specific heavy metals and that may result in hyper accumulation.

References

- Rodrigues P., Venancio A., Kozakiewicz Z. and Lima N. (2009), A polyphasic approach to the identification of aflatoxigenic and non-aflatoxigenic strains of Aspergillus Section Flavi isolated from Portuguese almonds. International Journal of Food and Microbiology, 129, 187-193.
- Aguado J., Arsuaga J. M., Arencibia A., Lindo M. and Gascón V. (2009), Aqueous heavy metals removal by adsorption on amine-functionalized mesoporous silica, Journal of Hazardous Materials, 163, 213-221.
- Akram M. K., Ashraf M. and Zeshan B. (2006), Impact assessment of sewage and industrial effluents on water resources, soil, crop and humen health in Faislabad.Res Report PCRWR., pp 1.
- Ansari, T. P., Kazi T. G. and Kazi G. H. (1993), Chemical compositions of vegetable grown on agricultural soil amended with sewage sludge of Mirpur Khas division. Proc. 5th National Chemistry Conference, Quaid-e-Azam University. Islamabad. Pp., 141-143.
- AOAC. (1984), Official Methods of Analysis. 15th Ed. Arlington, Virginia, USA. Waste Water Forum 2007. Standard for irrigational water.
- Asaolu (1995), Lead content of vegetable and tomatoes at Erekesan Market, Ado-Ekiti. *Pakistan Journal of Scientific* and Industrial Research, 38, 399-401.
- Ashwini A., Waoo A., Khare S. and Ganguli S. (2014), Extraction and Analysis of Heavy Metals from Soil and Plants in the Industrial Area Govindpura, Bhopal. *Journal Of Environment And Human*, ISSN (Print): 2373-8324 ISSN (Online): 2373-8332.
- Barman S. C., Sahu R. K., Bhargava S. K. and Chaterjee C. (2000), Distribution of heavy metals in wheat, mustard weeds grown in field irrigated with industrial effluents. *Bulletin of Environmental Contamination and Toxicology*, 64, 489-496.
- Chary, N. S., Kamala C. T. and Raj. D. S. (2008), Assessing risk of heavy metals from consuming food grown on sewage irrigated soils and food chain transfer. *Ecotoxicology and Environmental Safety*, 69, 513-524.
- Chen, Y., C. Wang and Z. Wang. (2005), Residues and source identification of persistent organic pollutants in farmland soils irrigated by effluents from biological treatment plants. *Environment International* 31: 778-783.
- Ensink, J. H., Mahmood T., Van der Hoek W., Raschid-Sally L. and Amerasinghe F. P. (2004), A nationwide assessment of wastewater use in Pakistan: An obscure activity or a vitally important one?. Water policy, 6, 197-206.
- Farid, S. (2003), Toxic elements concentration in vegetables irrigated with untreated city effluents. *Science and* Technology, 22, 58-60.

- Ghafoor A. (2004), Metal ion in city waste effluent: Effect of application on soils and vegetables. Final technical Report of the ARF project funded by Pakistan Agricultural Research Council, Islamabad.
- Ghafoor A., Rauf A., Arif M. and Muzaffar W. (1995), Chemical composition of effluent from different industries of the Faisalabad city. *Pakistan Journal of Agricultural Sciences*, 31, 37-69.
- Ghosh A. K., Bhatt M. A. and Agrawal H. P. (2012), Effect of long-term application of treated sewage water on heavy metal accumulation in vegetables grown in northern India. *Environmental monitoring and assessment*, 184, 1025.
- Gupta N., Khan D. K., and Santra S. C. (2012), Heavy metal accumulation in vegetables grown in a long-term wastewaterirrigated agricultural land of tropical India. Environmental monitoring and assessment, 184, 6673-6682.
- Huibers F. P., Moscoso O. Duran A. and Lier J. B. V. (2004), The use of waste water in cochabamba, Bolivia: a degrading environment. IDRC Books Free online. http://www.idrc.ca.
- Issac R. A. and Johnson W. C. (1975), Collaboration study of wet and dry ashing techniques for elemental analysis of plant tissue by atomic absorption spectrophotometer. *Journal-Association of Official Analytical Chemists.* 58: 436-440.
- Jagtap M. N., Kulkarni M. V. and Puranik P. R. (2010), Flux of heavy metal in soils irrigated with urban waste water. *American Eurasian Journal of Agricultural and Environmental Sciences* 8, 487-493.
- Khan A., Ibrahim M., Ahmad N. and Anwer S. A. (1992), Studies on accumulation and distribution of heavy metals in agricultural soils receiving sewage effluents irrigation. Pp. 607-609. *In:* Proceedings of 4th National Congress of Soil Science, 24-26 May, 1992. Islamabad.
- Khan A., Javid S., Muhmood A., Mjeed T., Niaz A. and Majeed A. (2013), Heavy metal status of soil and vegetables grown on peri-urban area of Lahore district. *Soil Environment*, 32, 49-54
- Khan S., Cao Q., Zheng Y. M., Huang Y. Z. and Zhu Y. G. (2008), Health risks of heavy metals in contaminated soils and food crops irrigated with wastewater in Beijing, China. *Environmental Pollution*, 152, 686-692.
- Liu C. P., Luo C. L., Gao Y. Li, F. B., Lin, L. W., Wu C. A. and Li. X. D. (2006), Arsenic contamination and potential health risk implications at an abandoned tungsten mine, southern China. *Environmental Pollution*, 158, 820-826
- Malla, R., Y. Tanaka, K. Mori and K. L. Totawat. (2007), Short term effect of sewage irrigation on chemical buildup in soil and vegetables. *The Agricultural Engineering. International CIGR EjournalManuscript* 9, 14.
- Meyer S. T., Castro S. R., Fernandes M. M., Soares A. C., de Souza Freitas G. A. and Ribeiro E. (2016), Heavy-metalcontaminated industrial soil: Uptake assessment in native plant species from Brazilian Cerrado. *International journal of Phytoremediation*, 18, 832-38.
- Mitra A. and Gupta S. K. (1999), Effect of sewage water irrigation on essential plant nutrients and pollutant elements status in a vegetable growing area around Calcutta. *Journal of Indian Society of Soil Science*, 47, 99-105.
- Qadir, M., Wichelns, D., Raschid-Sally, L., McCornick, P. G., Drechsel, P., Bahri, A. And Minhas, P. S. (2010), The challenges of wastewater irrigation in developing countries. *Agricultural Water Management*, 97, 561-568.
- Ronaq, R. N., Haider I., Qadir M. and Hasnain N. (2005), Studies on the distribution of heavy and toxic metals (Copper, Lead, Zinc and Cadmium) in different vegetables using Atomic

Absorption Spectroscopy. Proceedings of 5th National Chemical Conference, Islamabad, Pakistan. pp. 63-64.

- Sahu R. K, Katiyar S., Tiwari J. and Kisku G. C. (2007), Assessment of drain water receiving effluent from tanneries and its impact on soil and plants with particular emphasis on bioaccumulation of heavy metals. *Journal of Environmental Biology*. 28, 685-90.
- Singh K. P., Mohan D., Sinha S. and Dalwani R. (2004), Impact assessment of treated/untreated wastewater toxicants discharged by sewage treatment plants on health, agricultural, and environmental quality in the wastewater disposal area. Chemosphere, 55, 227–255
- Soltanpour, P. N. and S. Workman. (1985), Modification of the NaHCO₃ DTPA soil test to omit carbon black. *Communications in Soil Science and Plant Analysis*, 10, 1411-1420.
- Steel R. G. D., Torrie J. H. and Dickey D. A. (1997), Principals and Procedures of Statistics. 3rd Ed. McGraw Hill Inc., New York. USA.
- Ullah, H., I. Khan and I. Ullah. (2011), Impact of sewage wastewater-irrigated agricultural land of tropical India. *Environ. Monit. Assess.*, Epub. ahead of print. http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/22131014.
- Water of peri-urban Peshawar, Pakistan. Environ. Monit. Assess. Epub. ahead of print.http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/22203410.
- WHO. (1996), Guidelines for drinking water quality. Health criteria and other supporting information 34/9960 Mastercom/Wiener Velag-800, Australia.
- Zhang M., Heaney D., Henriquez B., Solberg E., and Bittner E. (2006), A four-year study on influence of biosolids/MSW cocompost application in less productive soils in Alberta, nutrient dynamics. *Compost Science*, 14, 68-80.
- Hussain I., Raschid L., Hanjra M. A., Marikar F., Van der Hoek. W. (2002), Wastewater use in agriculture: Review of impacts and methodological issues in valuing impacts. (With an extended list of bibliographical references). Working Paper 37. Colombo, Sri Lanka: International Water Management Institute.
- McLean, E. O. (1982), Soil pH and Lime requirement. In Page, A. L., R. H. Miller and D. R. Keey.Eds. Methods of Soil Analysis Part 2. Amer. Soc. Agron. No.9. Madison, Wisconsin, USA. 199-209.
- World Wide Fund (WWF). 2007. A special report on Pakistan waters at risk: water and health related issues in Pakistan and key recommendations. Pp.1-25.